

**PROCEEDING OF THE MEETING OF THE PUNJAB MEDICAL COUNCIL UNDER
THE CHAIRMANSHIP OF DR. MANMOHAN SINGH, PRESIDENT HELD ON 11-10-
2007 AT 11.00 AM**

The following members of the council attended the meeting: -

1. Dr. Hardipinder Singh, Member
2. Dr. Anurag Goswami, Member
3. Dr. Randhir Kumar, Member
4. Dr. Vinod Sood, Member
5. Dr. S.P.S. Grover, Member
6. Dr. P.S. Bakhshi, Member
7. Dr. Balbir Singh Shah

The council ratified the recommendations of the Disciplinary Committee meeting, which was held on 11-10-2007.

The Council meeting ended with the vote of thanks to the chair

Sd/-
President,
Punjab Medical Council,
Mohali.

Endst.No.PMC/2007/ 2972

Dated :29-10-07

Copy forwarded for information to Principal Secretary, Medical Education & Research, Punjab, Chandigarh.

Sd/-
Registrar,
Punjab Medical Council,
Mohali

Endst.No.PMC/2004/ 2973

Dated :29-10-2007

Copy forwarded for information to:

1. Dr. Balbir Singh Shaha, Member, 593-1, Model Town, Ludhiana.
2. Dr. Hardipinder Singh, Member, 599-R, Model Town, Jalandhar.
3. Dr. Anurag Goswami, Member, Ashirwad Hospital, 112-A, Model Town Extension, Ludhiana.
4. Dr. Randhir Kumar, Member, 339, New Jawahar Nagar, Jalandhar City.
5. Dr. Vinod Sood, Member, C/o Surindra Diagnostic Lab, Opp. Bank of Punjab, G.T. Road, Khanna, Distt. Ludhiana.
6. Dr. S.P.S. Grover, Member, 26-Link Road, Lajpat Nagar, Jalandhar City.
7. Dr. P.S. Bakhshi, Member, Bawa Hospital, 517, New Jawahar Nagar, Jalandhar City.

Sd/-
Registrar,
Punjab Medical Council,
Mohali

**Proceedings of the Disciplinary Committee meeting held on 11-10-2007 under the
Chairmanship of Dr. Anurag Goswami, Chairman Disciplinary Committee, Punjab
Medical Council, Mohali**

The following members attended the committee meeting:

- | | | |
|--------------------------|---|----------|
| 1. Dr. Anurag Goswami | - | Chairman |
| 2. Dr. Hardipinder Singh | - | Member |
| 3. Dr. Randhir Kumar | - | Member |
| 4. Dr. S.P.S. Grover | - | Member |

The following agenda items were discussed in the meeting :-

ITEM NO. 1

Complaint against Dr. Rajinder Bansal as alleged by Mr. Maninder Pal Singh

Maninder Pal Singh Complainant attended the meeting alongwith a few persons from Muktsar who had accompanied Maninder Pal Singh. Maninder Pal Singh submitted the relevant documents in favour his complaint. He also requested that he would submit more evidences against the doctor. Due opportunity was granted to the complainant and was allowed 7 days to submit documents, if any.

Dr. Rajinder Bansal also attended the meeting. He submitted documents in his defence alongwith the testimonial showing that he is a postgraduate and has sufficient facilities as compare to tertiary paediatric care hospital for the treatment of child. He also requested was submission of more documents in favouring his defence. Disciplinary Committee decided to give more time for the submission of paper to Dr. Rajinder Bansal.

The case be taken up in the next disciplinary committee meeting.

Dr. Rajinder Bansal & Complainant Mr. Maninder Pal Singh attended the meeting.

ITEM NO. 2

Complaint against Dr. Prem Singh as alleged by Mr. Bakhtawar Singh

As per the decision of the Disciplinary Committee dated 21-5-2006, Dr. Prem Singh was requested to submit the complete record pertaining to the case vide this office letter no PMC/2006/ 1123 dated 22-6-2007. The Civil Surgeon Moga was also requested to submit the copy of the medical report and other relevant documents pertaining to the case vide this office letter dated 22-6-2007. Civil Surgeon, Moga vide his letter dated 3-8-2007 has submitted the opinion dated 7-7-2004 of the medical board. The following were the members of the board :

1. Dr. S.R. Mittal, Surgical Specialist, Civil Hospital, Moga
2. Dr. S.S. Dhillon, Medical specialist, Civil Hospital, Moga.
3. Dr. R.S. Sandhu, Orthopaedic specialist, Civil Hospital, Moga
4. Dr. B.S. Puri, Orthopaedic Specialist, Civil Hospital, Moga.
5. Dr. Pardeep Sharma, Radiologist, Civil Hospital, Moga.

The board has exonerated the doctor. In para 34 of the report the board has mentioned that no illegality has been committed by the doctor as the doctor has informed the police.

From the record it appears that, the doctor has failed to pass the correct information about the operation and its prognoses to the patient/ attendants of the patient prior to the operation. The doctor did not tell the father of the diseases about the cause of death when the dead body was

handed over to the relations. From the report, it appears that no post mortem was conducted on the dead body of the diseases. In case there was, any doubt the post mortem was must have been done to certain the correct cause of death and negligence, if any, committed by the treating surgeon. In the absence of the post mortem and on the basis of the facts given in the report by the board there is no negligence proved on the part of the treating surgeon. However, since the doctor has failed in communicating the prognoses and cause of death to the relatives, which are ethically, require to be explained by the treating surgeon. The doctor has failed in his duty. Disciplinary Committee is of the opinion that the warning be issued to the surgeon to be vigilant in future.

ITEM NO. 3

Complaint against Dr. Arun Chander Dhup as alleged by Mr. Kailash Chand Aggarwal

The case was not discussed since the action has already been taken.

ITEM NO. 4

Complaint against doctors of Dayanand Medical College, Ludhiana as alleged by Mr. Krishan Lal.

Principal Govt. Medical College, Patiala was requested to constitute a committee of the experts including orthopaedician, physician & cardiologist to consider the documents and submit the report whether there was deficiency in service/ treatment of the patient. Principal constituted a committee of the following doctors :-

1. Dr. Anil Vij, Professor, Deptt. of Medicine.
2. Dr. A.S. Sandhu, Prof. & Head, Deptt. of Orthopaedics.
3. Dr. Harcharan Singh, Assistant Professor, Medicine.

The Principal submitted the enquiry report. The enquiry committee has submitted :-

1. During the stay of patient in hospital, the patient was regularly attended by orthopaedician, medical specialists, cardiologist, endocrinologist and Nephrologist and was given regular proper treatment.
2. From the record, the committee has not been able to find any negligence.

The enquiry report was considered and taken on record. Disciplinary Committee is of the opinion that since there is no deficiency in service/ negligence on the part of the treating doctor the complaint be filed.

ITEM NO. 5

Complaint against Dr. Ajit Pal Singh as alleged by Mr. Ved Parkash Gupta

The Secretary Department of Health & Family Welfare was requested to relevant papers regarding enquiry be conducted by the government. Director Health Services, Punjab was also requested to send the outcome of the enquiry instituted against the doctor no information has been received either from the government or DHS. The complainant and the doctor were requested to appear before the disciplinary committee.

The case was also sent to Krishan Singh Dadwal, Additional Advocate General Punjab for his expert opinion whether the department can proceed with the departmental proceedings. The Additional advocate General has opined that the disciplinary committee can proceed further as

per rules and regulations. The Additional AG was requested to attend the disciplinary committee meeting on 11-20-2007. AAG showed his inability to attend the meeting due to the court cases. The complainant has not attended the disciplinary committee meeting.

Dr. Ajit Pal Singh attended the committee meeting and submitted the documents in his defence. Balwant Singh Makhu, General Secretary, Lok Sangram Manch, Punjab (RDF), VPO Charik, Distt. Moga alongwith Sukhwinder Kaur, General Secretary, Women Mukti Manch, (Punjab) requested that they should be heard in connection with the complaint against Dr. Ajit Pal Singh. They were not asked to attend the disciplinary committee meeting. However, in the interest of justice they were allowed to submit their opinion. They submit their request that the pamphlet was issued by their Manch and fully support the contents of the pamphlet and further requested that the complaint against doctor be filed.

Surjit Singh Phul, State President, Bharti Kisan Union (Krantikari) Punjab VPO Phul, Patti Jatana, Tehsil Phul Distt. Bhatinda also submitted their representation and have requested to file the complaint since the complainant against the doctor with malice.

Dr. Ajit Pal Singh, requested to give time to submit more documents in his defence. Dr. Ajit Pal Singh was allowed to submit the documents within a period of 7 days.

ITEM NO. 6

Complaint against Dr. Harminderjit Kaur Jog, Maternity and Nursing Home, Mansa for the alleged death of Smt. Minakshi D/o Sh. Raj Kumar.

The doctor has submitted reply to this office notice dated 3-9-2007 vide letter dated 12-9-2007. Chief Judicial Magistrate, Mansa vide order dated 13-11-1999 has dismissed the complaint of the appellant. The revision petition was also dismissed by the Hon'ble Additional Session Judge, Mansa vide order dated 6-1-2001. The case has also been dismissed by the State Consumer Disputes Redressal commission, Punjab vide order dated 1-8-2002.

The case was discussed in detail. In view of the judgements delivered by the courts & commission, we are of the opinion that there is no prima facie negligence on the part of the doctor in the present complaint. The case be filed.

ITEM NO. 7

Complaint against Dr. Harpreet Kaur Bhullar as alleged by Mr. Surinder Singh

The complainant has submitted an affidavit to withdraw the complaint unconditionally and has requested to dismiss the complaint as withdrawn. The request of the complainant and the affidavit are place on record. Disciplinary committee is of the opinion that the complaint be dismissed as withdrawn and be filed.